

included and excluded. The reputation also follows museum professionals, even after many of them are being trained in universities. Many historians, academic and otherwise, find value in the use of local history in academic studies and in publishing it for the public. Increasingly historians, academic and otherwise, have called for all to work together rather than to criticize each other from separate camps. Because this is echoed so many times on both sides of the Atlantic, it is surprising that so little has been done to bridge that gap. England and the United States could learn much from each other by developing an exchange between local historical organizations, since the problems associated with local history are often quite similar.²⁰ A fuller recognition of the museum profession in local historical studies in England, could, for example, create new alliances and collaboration serving all who work in the field.

Reviews

Iconoclasm: A Historiographical Essay

Lois A. Dickenson

Lois Dickenson is a graduate student at Eastern Illinois. This review essay was written for a graduate seminar on the Renaissance and Reformation for Professor Joy Kammerling during Fall 1996. It examines the historiography of iconoclasm across Reformation Europe.

Historians have long acknowledged that the rejection of the validity of image worship, often followed by outbursts of iconoclasm, was the hallmark of the Protestant Reformation in many communities. Interpretations of the changes in the popular perception of religious images differ widely. Some historians have noted an abrupt, rapid, and widespread change in image perception, while others argue that it occurred slowly and reluctantly on the part of the common population. The basis for iconoclastic acts has also been debated. Was iconoclasm a natural product of Protestant theology, or was it an expression of local/regional socio-economic or political factors? Alternatively, was iconoclasm an expression of ritualistic symbolism traditional among the general population?

This essay reviews the scholarly debate on these questions. Because of the multi-faceted dimensions of the problem of images and iconoclasm during the Reformation, the theses and arguments examined herein are drawn from several schools of historical thought—art history, social history, intellectual history—with the belief that these differing approaches contribute unique insights. Likewise, the broad geographic range of iconoclastic events has prompted the inclusion of arguments based on incidents scattered from France to Russia. The variance in local background provides not only a basis for examining similarities and differences in the arguments concerning the basis for iconoclasm, but also provides an opportunity to examine the

²⁰Cavendish, "British Association," 62-3; Larry E. Tise, "State and Local History: A Future from the Past," *The Public Historian* 1 (Summer 1979): 14-

significance that the reformers placed on the image question.³ The survival of devotional pictures for the home and the combination of images with text in *Merkbild* (Pictorial Reminders) demonstrates that Protestants continued to value the educational function of images.⁴

While acknowledging the validity of the communicative value of religious images, scholarly arguments based in other historical schools indicate the shortcomings of such a broad-based conclusion. Lee Wandel argues, from a sociological point of view, that far from worshipping religious images as idols, the general population understood the meditative and metaphorical functions of images in the churches. Images were not mistaken for the deity, but provided religious metaphors, analogies and evocations for the worshiper to use in developing a personal and private concept of God.⁵

Precisely because the conceptualization of images "remained personal," Wandel argues, the modern term "cult of the image" is a misnomer for the relationship between an image and the viewer. This term is based not on the perceptions of images (for which Wandel says no evidence has been presented) but on studies of behavior during worship, derived from medieval descriptions.⁶ This view must be contrasted with the more traditional interpretation of the cult of images embraced by Eamon Duffy, who presents the cult of images as a vital and active part of lay worship, with an internal structure and rationale, and specific mystic functions.⁷ Duffy's work offers an unusual point of departure for a Reformation historian, in that he rejects the common perception of widespread dissatisfaction with late medieval Catholicism, viewing the Reformation not as a fulfillment of religious longings, but as a violent disruption of a diverse and vigorous religion.⁸

³Ibid., 112.

⁴Ibid., 119.

⁵Lee Palmer Wandel, *Foracious Idols and Violent Hands: Iconoclasm in Reformation Zurich, Strasbourg and Basel* (Cambridge, 1995), 40-1.

⁶Ibid., 51.

⁷Eamon Duffy, *The Stripping of the Altars: Traditional Religion in England 1400-1580* (New Haven, 1992), 169-70.

⁸Ibid., 4.

debate on the effectiveness of iconoclasm as a tool in the expansion of Protestantism in Europe.

Iconoclasm is the most visually compelling aspect of the relationship between Protestantism and the visual arts, but the complex problem of religious imagery is a thread which runs continuously throughout the Reformation period, not a snippet which surfaces for brief violent moments. Ernst Ullman has examined this relationship from the standpoint of an art historian. He argues that the relationship between art and the Reformation is based on the conception of art as a communication tool, both used and influenced by Protestantism.¹ Besides the unarguable utility of the woodcuts to the Protestant cause, Ullman also argues that fine art served an educational role in spreading the precursory ideas of the Reformation. By examining the symbolism and subjects of paintings by Albrecht Durer, Lukas Cranach and other painters, Ullman demonstrates a rising sense of individualization and dissatisfaction in society prior to the Reformation and argues that the Protestant ideals of the Christian's direct relationship with God was present in pre-Reformation society.² Ullman's argument rests upon the point that fine paintings were a major tool in educating the common people—a point which is debatable, since Ullman offers no evidence of widespread exposure to such works among the general population (this obviously does not apply to the medium of the woodcut or pamphlet). It seems equally valid to presume that fine painting played a reactive rather than proactive role in pre-Reformation society, reflecting thoughts and beliefs present in the elite circles with which the artists interacted, rather than attempting to inculcate the general population with new beliefs.

In Ullman's argument, while iconoclasm struck at the liturgical base and material wealth of the Catholic Church, its significance lay in its communicative function. The true danger and value of religious images lay in their ability to communicate ideology and beliefs for both Catholics and Protestants. The level and duration of iconoclastic activity indicated the degree of

¹Ernst Ullman, "Reformation and Iconoclasm," *Journal of Popular Culture* 18 (Winter 1984): 102.

²Ibid., 105.

It is also a misconception to attempt to unify the views of the major figures of the Reformation on the question of images. Carlos Eire specifically addresses this issue, saying that although iconoclasm was the most visible characteristic of Protestant attacks on medieval piety, it did not reflect a consensus of opinion among reformers on theological doctrine or actual reforming policy.⁹ Similarly, Sergiusz Michalski argues that it is an error to assume that the major reformers were intimately familiar with the work of one another. This common assumption tends, Michalski says, to falsely unify certain doctrinal aspects and activities among the reformers. Michalski instead argues that the theology of the Reformation cannot be realistically perceived as linear in development; that all the major non-Lutheran reformers may have reached similar conclusions on the image question, but that their reasoning proceeded from different beginning points.¹⁰ For most reformers (Luther included, but excluding Calvin) the question of images was something addressed only under the pressure of events and was of secondary importance to the more central need to reform the liturgy.¹¹ Calvin's ministry occurred primarily after Protestantism had been established in Geneva, and so his carefully rationalized theology had a unique place for iconoclasm, although the issue is never directly addressed. Instead, the condemnation of images is contained in the Calvinist rejection of intermediaries in the essentially static relationship between God and mankind.¹²

Iconoclasm was, at least in some sense, the practical application of the theological debate on images among the reformers. Phyllis Mack suggests that iconoclasm was a universal phenomena of the Reformation.¹³ Eire defines it as the expression of the social and political dimensions of Reformed

ideology/theology on the part of the laity.¹⁴ Other scholars suggest that political, economic or sociological factors were the prominent factors which shaped iconoclastic incidents. Michalski provides the broadest base for interpretation with his thesis that iconoclasm was not moncausal in origin, nor derived from any single theological source. Because of this multidimensional form, it manifested differing aspects in different places according to local conditions and culture. Michalski interprets iconoclasm primarily as a projection of crowd psychology, which in turn, depends on factors such as the quality of Protestant leadership, the amount of local resistance to reform, and local political conditions.¹⁵

Although this thesis is broadly sociological in outlook, Michalski accepts the validity of the influence of theological, political, and economic factors in iconoclastic outbursts. Indeed in some iconoclastic incidents in Eastern Europe, he acknowledges such factors are predominant. In incidents where iconoclasm was imposed on an unwilling population from above (for example, the Czech King Frederick V) political factors are the prominent triggers. Likewise, in iconoclastic incidents where quasi-ritualistic elements are prominent, theological and cultural factors may be dominant (as expressed by Robert Scribner).¹⁶

Cultural and political factors, according to Michalski, played a significant role in the failure of Protestantism to establish itself in areas dominated by Eastern Orthodoxy. Although contact between Greek Orthodoxy and Protestantism was slight, significant iconoclastic incidents occurred in the Baltic and Polish Commonwealth-areas under the influence of Russian Orthodoxy. Here, iconoclastic acts tended to identify Protestants with internal heresies within Russian Orthodoxy and with the Byzantine iconoclastic controversy of the eighth century, which was a seminal event for the shaping of the Russian Orthodox religion.¹⁷ The unique political amalgamation of the Russian monarchy and the Russian Orthodox Church also tended to discourage Protestantism; however, the decisive factor may simply have been

⁹Carlos M.N. Eire, *War Against the Idols: The Reformation of Worship from Erasmus to Calvin* (Cambridge, 1986), 55.

¹⁰Sergiusz Michalski, *The Reformation and the Visual Arts: The Protestant Image Question in Western and Eastern Europe* (London, 1993), 43.

¹¹*Ibid.*, 37, 59.

¹²*Ibid.*, 59.

¹³Phyllis Mack, "The Wordyear: Reformed Preaching and Iconoclasm in the Netherlands," in *Religion and the People 800-1700*, ed. James Obelkevich (Chapel Hill, 1979), 192.

¹⁴Eire, *War Against the Idols*, 6.

¹⁵Michalski, *Reformation*, 79.

¹⁶*Ibid.*, 83-5, 93-6.

¹⁷*Ibid.*, 100.

the extreme cultural difference in religious perceptions between an iconoclastic Protestantism and an extremely icondulistic Orthodoxy.¹⁸

Michalski sees iconoclasm as a kind of "point of no return" for the breaking with the old faith. This point varies with location and can mark the beginning of the physically active phase of the Reformation. Iconoclasm is thus subject to the dialectics of revolutionary process, marking the move of the Reformation to a more radical stage, a discharge of social tension, or a mechanism to channel the actions of radical elements into specific areas.¹⁹

Michalski's thesis is very broadly based, but other historians have considered iconoclasm from a more definite orientation. Ullman, as has been discussed, approached iconoclasm as a art historian. The other authors considered herein, fall into one of the broadly defined categories of socio-political, socio-economic, or socio-ritualistic. It seems appropriate, therefore, to compare their arguments within these groupings.

Wandel presents a thesis which falls predominately within the socio-ritualistic category. Wandel's work is based on the premise that iconoclasm was a kind of synergetic action, lead neither wholly by "the people" nor by theologians, but the result of a resonance between the clergy's theological changes and the people's cultural heritage.²⁰ Iconoclasm reflected a symbiotic partnership between the reformation leadership and the activity of the common Christian. In studying iconoclastic incidents in Zurich, Strasbourg and Basel, Wandel determined that the decisive factor in these acts was not the theological interpretation of the meaning of images, but the traditional popular associations the images carried in the minds of the laity. So, while the reformed ministry may have acted as the initial focus to raise tensions in these cities, ultimately, it was the people who chose iconoclastic targets, according to their own mental associations. In Zurich, where the reformation focus was on the establishment of a Christian economy, the iconoclastic focus was upon images that consumed material resources. In Strasbourg, the reformation

¹⁸Ibid., 152.

¹⁹Ibid., 79-80.

²⁰Wandel, *Coractions Idols*, 24.

focus on the invalidity of Catholic rites turned the iconoclasts to focus on the geographic centers of such rites—the altars. In Wandel's view, iconoclastic acts were ultimately important not only because they destroyed the traditional referents of religion, ensuring a reformed practice, but also because they ensured that the popular view of how a Christian should worship and should organize his civic and personal life would receive equal importance with the idealized views of such matters in the minds of the clergy.²¹

Robert Scribner also interprets iconoclasm as a socio-ritualistic phenomena. Scribner's thesis is that the entirety of the Reformation can be perceived as a ritual process. Protestants were attempting, through iconoclastic acts, to tear down old social rituals and establish new ones based on Evangelical tenets. Iconoclasm was essentially ritualistic in nature, either by association with ritualistic occasions, subverting or parodying established ritual or becoming antiritualistic in the act of disturbing established ceremonies and rites.²² Scribner also introduces the relationship between iconoclasm and Carnival as complementary forms of popular communication. Both are stylized forms of behavior which occur in a "set aside" time and place and provide symbolic models of social relationships.²³

Because iconoclasm represents the establishment of new rituals in society, Scribner maintains that they must be evaluated in terms of the old ritualistic order they are meant to replace or subvert. In societies, rituals are meant to unify communities; iconoclasm was a ritualistic inversion of this purpose—it was intended to be socially decisive.²⁴ Similarly, iconoclastic acts often took on aspects of other civic or folk rituals. Thus, an iconoclastic action involving an image may take on a ritualistic pattern similar to a social rite of passage, the dispensation of civic justice, or community purification rites.²⁵

In both Wandel and Scribner the key to iconoclastic acts lies in the public perception of the social use of religious images.

²¹Ibid., 194-6.

²²Robert W. Scribner, "Ritual and Reformation," in *The German People and the Reformation*, ed. R. Po-Chia Hsia (Ithaca, 1988), 122-3.

²³Ibid., 125.

²⁴Ibid., 130.

²⁵Ibid., 135.

eneration of images was a practice deeply ingrained in the popular culture and unlikely to change quickly. So it is probable that images retained some of their perceived symbolic power to access the divine. However, in the situation of social and economic tension that developed in the Thurgau, images also came to be regarded as the products of and symbols for the resented feudal regime as maintained by the Church. Protestantism offered an alternative Christian culture free of feudal social and economic structures which was more attractive to the aspirations of the elite peasantry. Maarbjerg argues that this ambivalent attitude toward religious images explains the general passivity toward, or support of, iconoclastic acts in the Thurgau.²⁵

The socio-political interpretation of iconoclastic phenomena presents an opportunity to examine the problems encountered by the Reformation in different political systems in its spread throughout Europe. Each of the scholars presented in this section has based his research in a different country. Eire examines the political nature of the Reform in Geneva. Natalie Zemon Davis examines the violent nature of the French Reformation. Phyllis Mack presents a stark contrast to Davis in her examination of the orderly iconoclastic Wouderyear of the Netherlands. Finally, Duffy examines the phenomena of a Reformation imposed from above in Tudor England.

Eire contends that iconoclasm in the Genevan reformation was the crowd's tool to publicly test and disprove the legality of the Roman Catholic cultus.²⁶ In Eire's view, iconoclasm was a tactic encouraged by the Protestant reformers to put pressure on a city council reluctant to enact the Reformation. By destroying the images, the Reformers presented the council with a *fait accompli*, and thus succeeded through an act of rebellion.²⁷ Iconoclasm becomes a revolutionary tactic in Eire's thesis, directed against accepted social myths. Iconoclasm may take one of several forms, legal or illegal, individual or collective, orderly or riotous, but in any of these forms the revolutionary intent is apparent: the overturning of the status quo. Iconoclasm, despite

²⁵Ibid., 551.

²⁶Eire, *War Against the Idols*, 107.

²⁷Ibid., 147.

Although theologians play a role in Wandel's synergy, the ritualistic choice of targets and forms of action in both Wandel and Scribner lies with the common man. Important also is the intended social purpose both authors describe: the reordering of society to be the goal of iconoclasts.

John Maarbjerg's thesis is essentially socio-economic. In his study of two incidents of iconoclasm in the Thurgau, Maarbjerg concludes that social tensions were an integral part of iconoclastic acts, and that, in the Thurgau, the source of these tensions was the deeply ambiguous perceptions of the rural peasantry toward the social, political and economic power of the Catholic Church.²⁸ Maarbjerg theorizes that increasing population pressure, the marginalization of farms as viable economic units, and the increasing restrictions of traditional small-holders' rights to access pastures and woodlands, combined with the rural awareness of nearby urban unrest, served to heighten social and economic tension in rural areas. These economic and social factors were also occurring at a time when the rural peasantry was attempting to free itself from the last bonds of serfdom in the form of feudal rents and dues. Since the Church was the largest feudal landlord in this area, the disparity between the socio-political and economic aims of the peasantry and the Church were bound to increase. As the economic status of the rural peasantry declined, the egalitarian nature of the Zurich social model and the Zwinglian concept of redistributing the wealth of the Church to the poor was particularly attractive.²⁹ This socio-economic instability is probably enough to explain the attacks on church lands, but the initial removal of images by village officials may perhaps also be traced to this instability, if the assumption is made that the restless peasantry was also challenging the leadership of the literate peasant elite.³⁰ Iconoclasm by the village officials would then be interpreted as an effort to regain the support of the peasantry.

The ambivalence of the population toward religious images plays a particularly prominent role in Maarbjerg's argument. The

²⁸John P. Maarbjerg, "Iconoclasm in the Thurgau: Two Related Incidents in the Summer of 1524," *Sixteenth Century Journal* 24 (Fall 1993): 579.

²⁹Ibid., 587.

³⁰Ibid.

its religious content, is in essence a political act that involves public participation, often for the purpose of usurping governmental authority.³² But Eire also makes it clear that iconoclasm must be dependent on ideology: "Vandalism is wanton destruction; iconoclasm is the destruction of religious objects for ideological reasons."³³

Davis's work on the French Reformation examines the question of the social meaning inherent in religious rioting. Drawing on previous work done on crowd analysis for economic and political riots in the sixteenth century, Davis's thesis asks if the strong links between violence, economic issues and class conflict established in bread and tax riots are also inherent in the religious rioting of the French Reformation. If no such class conflict can be detected in religious rioting, how then can the historian interpret the social meaning of religious violence?³⁴ Davis's analysis of the composition of the crowd during religious rioting establishes that class conflict was not a major factor in religious riots, since all economic and social classes participated, and the crowd leadership was usually made up of a mixture of classes. In order to discern the true nature of religious rioting, Davis examines the goals of the rioters, their targets, the kinds of actions they undertook, and the occasions which prompted iconoclastic actions.

Davis's theory on the behavior of religious rioters hinges on the interpretation of their actions as mimicking the actions of legitimate political and religious authority. The crowds took on these roles when they perceived a failure on the part of the legitimate authorities to undertake their duties. Thus, when the crowd perceived that the clergy (either Catholic or Reformed) had failed to challenge and test false doctrine, the crowd took on the clerical role by testing false doctrine through iconoclastic acts.³⁵ It was at this point that the ritualistic aspects of iconoclasm theorized by Robert Scribner came into play. The cleansing of the community of "pollution" (by either side, Catholic or

³²*Ibid.*, 155-6.

³³*Ibid.*, 159.

³⁴Natalie Zemon Davis, "The Rites of Violence," in *Society and Culture in Early Modern France*, (Stanford, 1965), 155.

³⁵*Ibid.*, 156.

Protestant) was a major concern of the rioters, since moral/religious pollution was seen a provocation to God to visit mankind with natural disasters.³⁶ The crowd also usurped the magistrate's function to punish idolaters and the wicked. Since both the Protestants and Catholics saw the other side as pollutants, idolaters and adherents to a false faith, the French religious riots could be precipitated by either side with equal justification. The crowds also drew a type of legitimacy for their actions from the common magisterial practice of "deputizing" segments of the population for legal for religious purposes, such as chasing criminals or baptizing babies. When the magistrates "deputized," they often chose organized groups, such as confraternities. It was precisely these types of organized groups which often formed the nucleus of a rioting crowd.³⁷

Davis's analysis of the occasion of religious riot agrees closely with the findings of Scribner, in that they seem tied to the celebration of religious rituals and sacred places. Thus, religious processions were always a likely target for iconoclastic rioting. Likewise, the two scholars agree that the rioters drew on a common popular repertory of beliefs and perceptions to make their actions ritually comprehensible. Like Scribner, Davis also finds that the underlying theme of religious rioting was a concern with the societal order, either re-establishing it to traditional Catholic model or redefining it to the Evangelical model. Where Davis differs from Scribner, and what makes her thesis socio-political in orientation is the quasi-legitimacy of the crowd in taking over the magisterial function in enforcing moral/civic law.

In sharp contrast to the violence of the French Reformation, the Reformation in the Netherlands had the defining characteristic of limited popular participation in a short, relatively non-violent, orderly, and regionally successive iconoclastic movement. Mack, in examining the Wonderyear, presents the thesis that iconoclasm in the Netherlands was of such short duration and so orderly because, due to political factors, it was not an expression of mass sentiment. Without further consideration, this thesis would indicate a lack of support for the Reformation. But Mack

³⁶*Ibid.*, 159.

³⁷*Ibid.*, 168.

concludes that the most important aspect of the Dutch Reformation was hedge preaching, which she characterizes as a relatively conservative phenomena, a socializing experience and one that reinforced social stability.³⁸ The idea of social stability is crucial to Mack's thesis; in her analysis the relative conservatism of the Dutch Reformation movement was a response to a mass perception of the breakdown of political authority, due to physical absence of the monarch, the ineffectiveness of the regent, and the withdrawal of the local nobility from political life.³⁹ In this scenario, both Catholic and Protestants valued the aura of legitimacy over the ritualistic expressions of rejection of their opponents. This prevented a polarization of society; instead society fragmented into numerous groups with confused goals and loyalties, and thus were paralyzed from taking violent action.⁴⁰

Since hedge preaching was the major expression of the Dutch Reformation, the Calvinist ministers were the natural heirs to fill the void of higher authority. Circumstances surrounding their presence in the Netherlands, however, conspired to make this group also relatively conservative. First, trained ministers in the Netherlands were somewhat of a rarity, and what ministers there were had been trained in differing cities and under differing circumstances, and reflected the multi-cultural and multilingual heritage of the Netherlands. The role of the lay pastors in the development of the hedge preaching was therefore crucial. This group, made up of locally popular speakers, had the opportunity to turn the crowds to violence, but, as a group, they seemed to identify with the goals of the trained ministry in seeking legitimacy above destruction.⁴¹ This concern for legitimate authority was also an effort on the part of the ministry to distance themselves from the radical actions of the extreme left wing of the Reformation.

In Mack's analysis, then, the underlying theme of the Dutch Reformation was the search for social and political stability that the general population perceived had been surrendered by the

³⁸Mack, "The Wonderyear," 196, 211.

³⁹*Ibid.*, 203.

⁴⁰*Ibid.*, 206.

⁴¹*Ibid.*, 209-1.

government and the nobility. The emphasis the Reformed clergy put on their own legitimacy as social leaders allowed them to fill this perceived void. The ritualistic need to remove the symbols of the old regime became less important than the search for authority, and in any case, society was so fragmented than the mass organization of such an effort was impossible. Mack also poses the interesting idea that the iconoclasm which occurred in the Netherlands, orderly though it was, essentially ruined the delicate social balance of the hedge preaching, since it was directly counterproductive to the function of community stabilization and legitimacy.⁴²

In contrast to this portrayal of the Reformation filling a political void, Duffy argues that in Tudor England, the Reformation was imposed from above by legitimate political authorities. Duffy's thesis, as discussed earlier, posits existence of a vigorous and healthy Catholicism in the sixteenth century, which the general population gave up reluctantly and only under extreme pressure from the Tudor government. In his scenario, a small group of evangelical Protestants in positions of governmental authority were able, through manipulation of the monarchy and the legalization of iconoclastic and punitive acts, to impose the Reformation upon the English population. In Duffy's estimation their success at doing this was sporadic at best, due to local resistance, but the Reformation succeeded primarily through attrition, allowing enough time to pass for a generation educated in Protestantism to take control of the society.

In Duffy's argument the local resistance to Protestantism plus the lack of ideological commitment of Henry VIII to all the basic tenets of the new faith shaped the English Reformation to a local focus, making it necessary to fight to introduce Protestantism diocese by diocese.⁴³ The commitment to Protestantism on the part of the government was accomplished in the face of wavering monarchical support by the policy of placing Protestant clerics in diocesan and parish offices whenever possible, thus building a cadre of loyal clericals in positions of power.⁴⁴ These radical

⁴²*Ibid.*, 216.

⁴³Duffy, *The Stripping of the Altars*, 413.

⁴⁴*Ibid.*, 433.

Protestant clerics often found themselves at odds with their conservative parishes.

Within the structure of the English Reformation, iconoclasm takes on a unique role. Since Duffy dismisses the idea of a popular mass movement fueling iconoclastic acts, iconoclasm can be interpreted here as a tool of the legitimate government to force its will on the population. Duffy illustrates this point by noting that the legal attacks were directed toward the clearest expressions of popular religious practice—processionals, pilgrimages, and the veneration of images.⁴⁵ This interpretation of iconoclasm differs sharply from the popular ritualistic interpretation given by Scribner, Davis, and Wandel. In Duffy's estimation, the actions of the population, in hiding images, in resisting the Abrogation of Holy Days, and the introduction of the 1549 Prayer Book, are proof that the hold of traditional religion on the general population remained strong throughout the early Tudor era.⁴⁶ In this type of legalistically powered reform, compliance with the law cannot, in Duffy's opinion, be equated to popular acceptance or approval.⁴⁷

Iconoclasm was the heart of the Edwardian reforms, but Duffy maintains that the prompt removal of images cannot be used as evidence for the general acceptance of Protestantism, since community attachment to images varied, and the removal and sale of religious items was an accepted practice among Catholic dioceses with a cash-flow problem.⁴⁸ Evidence of the superficiality of the acceptance of Protestantism in the parishes is the prompt return of many of the removed items to the churches in the reign of Mary.⁴⁹

All of these authors acknowledge the complexity of iconoclastic phenomena. Several of these scholars have attempted a localized analysis of iconoclastic incidents. The work of Phyllis Mack, Natalie Davis, Richard Scribner and Lee Wandel provide valuable insights to crowd composition, motivation, and behavior. Eamon Duffy and Sergiusz Michalski

⁴⁵*Ibid.*, 452.

⁴⁶*Ibid.* 393, 466.

⁴⁷*Ibid.*, 462.

⁴⁸*Ibid.* 481-2.

⁴⁹*Ibid.*, 491.

111

have attempted to link the iconoclastic phenomena to broader political and cultural phenomena. In the final analysis, iconoclasm is a phenomena that cannot be easily classified or defined; it is dependent on a complex interplay of economic, political, religious, social, and psychological factors. The dominance of any of these factors in giving particular shape to an iconoclastic act is largely dependent on local/regional conditions and tensions. It was the peculiarities of communities which gave shape and symbolic meaning to their iconoclasm.